

WV INNOVATION ZONE APPLICATION SCORING RUBRIC

What items will be scored to determine approval of an innovation zone application and plan of innovative activities to support increased student learning? The actual award will be based on a consensus reached through discussion of the selection committee, not a simple totaling of points. The scoring points in the items below are only a guide for individuals on the selection committee to prioritize grants in their best judgment. Interviews and site-visits are two other methods of determining success of applications that will have an impact on the award of grants.

Elements of the Innovation Zone Scoring Rubric

The eleven elements of the *Rubric for Scoring Innovation Zone Applications and Plans* will primarily be used to help determine which applicants will be designated as Innovation Zones. The first four elements determine whether an application is eligible to be scored and must be evident in order to consider the application eligible. The remaining elements will be used to determine the strength of the application and plan. The maximum point values of these remaining elements are weighted to show the importance of each element to the success of the plan.

The rubric will have a secondary use as a guide to provide feedback to applicants as they continue to plan the innovation that will be implemented, and for those applicants who are not designated as innovation zones to improve their applications for resubmission.

Elements Required for Scoring the Application or Plan

1. Application is timely, complete and has required signatures.
2. Application contains assurance that 80% of the affected staff is supportive.
3. Application contains the appropriate evidence of stakeholder support.
4. Application contains request for waiver of policy, code or interpretation, if needed.

Elements Required Determining the Strength of the Application and Plan

5. Application contains a data driven assessment of needs.
6. Application contains research or prior practice that supports the desired innovation.
7. Application was developed by a team that looked at data to determine a need (problem needing solved), identified goals to solve the problem and improve service to the public, and designed a set of innovative activities and implementation responsibilities to achieve the goals.
8. The application describes activities that the applicant will use to improve the quality of service to the public, relationships of stakeholders, the culture of learning, commitment to results, and leadership.
9. The application describes how the plan measures the success of the results and monitors the implementation of the plan.
10. The application describes how the applicant will document the process of implementation and disseminates results to others who might want to duplicate the innovation to scale it up to larger numbers of schools.
11. The application contains a budget and narrative supporting the activities of the plan.

1. Application is timely and complete: The application has been submitted by the date due and has addressed all areas required to be in an *Innovation Zone Application*.

Application will not be scored or approved	Application will be scored
<p>Timely:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The application was submitted later than the date due required for the application. <p>Complete:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The application does not contain all portions necessary for a complete application according to W. Va. Policy 3236. <p>Signatures:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The application does not contain all required signatures 	<p>Timely:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The application was submitted prior to the date due deadline. <p>Complete:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The application contains all portions necessary for a complete application according to W. Va. Policy 3236. <p>Signatures:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The application contains all required signatures

Comments: _____

2. Staff commitment: The application or plan, appropriately documents staff commitment for being designated an Innovation Zone, or for commitment to implementing the Innovation Zone plan as described.

Application will not be scored or approved	Application will be scored
<p>Commitment:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Less than 80% of the affected staff has committed to support and implement the plan for becoming an Innovation Zone. <p>Procedure:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The application does not contain an assurance by the applicant that all procedures for obtaining staff commitment were followed according to W. Va. Policy 3236 and W.Va. Code § 18-5B-6. 	<p>Commitment:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 80% or more of the affected staff has committed to support and implement the plan for becoming an Innovation Zone. <p>Procedure:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The application contains an assurance by the applicant that all procedures for obtaining staff commitment were followed according to W. Va. Policy 3236 and W.Va. Code § 18-5B-6.

Comments: _____

3. Evidence of Support: The application contains evidence of support required to be in an *Innovation Zone Application* from all those who have a stake in the success of the plan.

Application will not be scored or approved	Application will be scored
<p>County Board(s) of Education:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The application does not contain a copy of the report of the support or concerns or both for the Innovation Zone application and plan submitted by the County Board(s) of Education to the school principal and others. <p>Local School Improvement Council(s):</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The application does not contain evidence of LSIC support for the Innovation Zone. <p>Parents:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The application does not contain evidence of parental support for the Innovation Zone. <p>Students:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The application does not contain evidence of student support for the Innovation Zone. <p>School Business Partners:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The application does not contain evidence of business partner support for the Innovation Zone. 	<p>County Board(s) of Education:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The application contains a copy of the report of the support or concerns or both for the Innovation Zone application and plan submitted by the County Board(s) of Education to the school principal and others. <p>Local School Improvement Council(s):</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The application contains evidence of LSIC support for the Innovation Zone including contact information, of LSIC representative. <p>Parents:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> LSICs contain parent representation. Therefore support from an LSIC in the application would indicate parents are in support of the application. As the plan is further developed it is expected that support from this stakeholder group would be gained by including them in the planning effort as described in the fully developed plan. <p>Students:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> LSICs contain student representation at the secondary level. Therefore support from an LSIC in the application would indicate students are in support of the application. As the plan is further developed it is expected that support from this stakeholder group would be gained by including them in the planning effort as described in the fully developed plan. <p>School Business Partners:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> LSICs contain business representation. Therefore support from an LSIC in the application would indicate businesses are in support of the application. As the plan is further developed it is expected that support from this stakeholder group would be gained by including them in the planning effort as described in the fully developed plan.

Comments: _____

4. Constraints to Implementation (if any): The application contains a list of all county and state board rules, policies, and interpretations, and all statues, **if any**, the applicant identified as prohibiting or constraining the implementation of the Innovation Zone plan.

Application will not be scored	Application will be scored
<p>County or State Board rule, policy or interpretation:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> If applicable the applicant does not complete the section of the application listing constraints to the Innovation Zone Plan for these items. <p>State Statute</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> If applicable the applicant does not complete the section of the application listing constraints to the Innovation Zone Plan for these items. <p>* Not Applicable</p> <p>Please note: if the applicant does not need a waiver for law, policy or interpretation in order to implement its innovative strategy, this section (4) of the rubric does not apply.</p>	<p>County or State Board rule, policy or interpretation:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The applicant lists any County or State Board rule, policy or interpretation that constrains it from becoming an Innovation Zone, explains why the item is a constraint on its action, and describes the relief from the item that is being requested. <p>State Statute</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The applicant lists any State statute that constrains it from becoming an Innovation Zone, explains why the item is a constraint on its action, and describes the relief from the item that is being requested.

Comments: _____

5. Needs Assessment: The needs assessment should indicate a clear statement of needs derived from an assessment of student learning needs and how the goals and objectives of the program are directly related to those needs.

Points: 0-5	Points: 6-10	Points: 11-15
<p>The needs assessment:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Provides no evidence of using data to determine the need for the proposed innovation zone plan. 	<p>The needs assessment:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Provides evidence of using data to determine need for the proposed innovation zone plan. 	<p>The needs assessment:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Provides clear and convincing evidence of using multiple sources of data to determine the need for the proposed innovation.

Score: _____ Comments: _____

6. Scientifically Based-Research: The literature review should discuss and cite the current state of knowledge relevant to the proposed innovation zone plan. This brief literature review should clearly indicate why the proposed activities were selected or designed. If the proposal builds on prior work, lessons learned are described and how these lessons are incorporated in the program is included.

Points: 0-3	Points: 4-7	Points: 8-10
<p>The literature reviewed:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Does not support the program. • Does not cite research from peer reviewed journals. • Does not provide references that employ sound research methods. <p>The application/plan:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Vaguely states lessons learned from evaluation of prior work. 	<p>The literature reviewed:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Supports some of the proposed activities selected or designed in the program. • Cites some accepted research sources from peer reviewed journals. • Provides references that employ some sound research methods. <p>The application/plan:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • States some lessons learned from evaluation of prior work. 	<p>The literature reviewed:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Clearly defines and supports the proposed activities selected or designed in the program. • Cites strong accepted research sources from peer reviewed journals. • Provides references that employ sound research methods. <p>The application/plan:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Supports and clearly states lessons learned from evaluation of prior work.

Score: _____ Comments: _____

7. Potential for Success: The applicant demonstrates, through a well organized application, and by record of success in previous projects that it has the potential to accomplish its creative vision of increased public service for the innovation plan.

Points: 0-6	Points: 7-14	Points: 15-20
<p>Design of application/plan:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Is not organized, is missing parts, or fails to build a logical link from one step of the plan to the next. <p>Record of success:</p> <p>The applicant does not address previous experience of those responsible for leading the plan.</p>	<p>Design of application/plan:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Is organized and written by a leadership team to link the applicant’s assessment of data to a set of needs that lead to goals, supported by a set of activities that logically support the goals and creating the new vision of improved public service for the innovation zone. <p>Record of success:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The applicant describes previous experience of those responsible for leading portions of the plan or successful projects led by those individuals. 	<p>Design of application/plan:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Is clearly organized and written by a representative leadership team to link the applicant’s assessment of data to a set of prioritized needs that lead to shared goals, supported by a set of research based activities that logically support the probable accomplishment of the goals and create the new mindset that will sustain its vision of improved public service for the innovation zone. The plan outlines a method of monitoring and adjusting activities based on feedback and data collected from those who have a stake in the outcomes of the plan. <p>Record of success:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The applicant describes previous experience of those responsible for leading portions of the plan and successful projects led by those individuals.

Score: _____ Comments: _____

8. Sustainability: The applicant has described elements in their plan which will result in change in the culture and habits of mind of the applicant so the vision of the staff for improved public service will be sustained after the plan is implemented and funding is gone.

Points: 0-5	Points: 6-10	Points: 11-15
<p>Public service improved:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The plan does not explain and provide evidence of the likelihood of how the proposed activities are connected to improving service to the larger school community. <p>Relationships:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The applicant describes no attempt to build relationships with those having a stake in the outcomes of increased learning and performance. <p>Culture of learning:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The plan does not describe procedures to be put in place which use data to make decisions and adjustments to the innovation. <p>Commitment to results:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The plan sets goals and objectives for the plan. <p>Leadership:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The plan does not describe how leadership is distributed to others or how leaders will build the capacity to implement the innovative actions to increase student learning and performance. 	<p>Public service improved:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The applicant describes a change from its normal mode of operation which should lead to improved service to the larger school community. <p>Relationships:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The plan describes a communication plan for all those having a stake in the outcomes of increased learning and performance. <p>Culture of learning:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The plan describes procedures to be put in place which value and learn how to use data to make decisions, set goals and adjust action. <p>Commitment to results:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The plan sets goals and objectives to be accomplished through the innovative activities of the plan. <p>Leadership:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The plan describes leadership that is distributed to a representative group within the applicant's organization that is committed to implementing the innovative actions to increase student learning and performance. 	<p>Public service improved:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The plan describes and provides evidence of the likelihood that the activities result in improved level of service, increased quality of service, or more equitable service which better meets the expectations of and enhances the level of trust between the applicant and those having a stake in the outcomes of the plan. <p>Relationships:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Plan describes an increase in purposeful interaction within the school and community, parents, central office, WVDE, and those necessary for removal of barriers to the success of innovatively improving learning performance. <p>Culture of learning:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The plan describes procedures to be put in place which value and learn how to use data to make decisions and set goals, build the capacity and means for acting on data while learning how to "fail forward", and collaborate with others in this culture of inquiry. <p>Commitment to results:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Plan sets short term objectives that, if accomplished, build trust with stakeholders for investments in reaching long term objectives. <p>Leadership:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The plan describes leadership that is distributed and open to all levels of the applicant's organization that is committed to learning whatever is necessary to use the innovative actions to create the new vision of improved student learning and performance.

Score: _____ Comments: _____

9. Plan of accountability and evaluation: A proposal for funds to establish an Innovation Zone is ultimately a plan to improve the service provided to the public by public schools. A proposal clearly describes how the innovative activities will be evaluated by the applicant and what feedback the applicant will use to inform those responsible for accomplishing activities.

Points: 0-5	Points: 6-10	Points: 11-15
<p>Evaluation plan:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Applicant plans to measure the student learning outcomes occurring as a result of the innovation. <p>Accountability plan:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The method by which the applicant will provide a measure of goals, objectives and outcomes of the activities of the innovation in order to be able to show improvement is unclear or absent Does not define the timelines for the program. Does not define the responsibilities of the participants in the plan. 	<p>Evaluation plan:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Applicant plans to measure the student learning outcomes occurring as a result of the innovation plus other outcomes of the innovation. <p>Accountability plan:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Describes the method by which the applicant will provide a pre and post measure of goals, objectives and outcomes of the activities of the innovation in order to be able to measure improvement against baseline data. Provides general timelines as to when activities will occur. Describes some responsibilities of the participants in the plan. 	<p>Evaluation plan:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Applicant plans to measure the participants satisfaction with activities developed for the innovation, the participant's acquisition of new knowledge and skill needed to implement the innovation, the organizations support for and change because of the innovation, the participant's use of new knowledge and skills needed for the innovation and student learning outcomes occurring as a result of the innovation. <p>Accountability plan:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Describes the method by which the applicant will provide a pre and post measure of all goals, objectives and outcomes of the activities of the innovation in order to be able to measure improvement against baseline data. Provides definitive timelines as to when activities will occur and their duration. Clearly defines the responsibilities of participants and how the applicant will receive and provide feedback when activities are monitored

Score: _____ Comments: _____

10. Scalability: The planned innovative activities will be documented well enough and what was learned from those activities will be widely disseminated in order to be scaled up and implemented broadly on a statewide basis. The activities are not dependent on specific people or dependent on a particular context.

Points: 0-3	Points: 4-7	Points: 8-10
<p>Documentation:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The plan reader must interpret from the application the records that would be available to show how the plan was implemented. <p>Dissemination:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The innovation zone plan contains a communication plan that collects information from and provides information for implementation and results of the plan. 	<p>Documentation:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The innovation zone has an implementation plan which describes records that will be kept that would allow the reader to understand who was responsible for the actions of the plan so that they could be contacted and questioned. Other records may also be described to help document the plan as implemented. <p>Dissemination:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The innovation zone plan contains a communication plan that collects information from and provides information for implementation and results of the plan to a wide range of those interested in the learning of students. 	<p>Documentation:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The innovation zone has an implementation plan which describes records that will be kept that would allow the reader to understand who was responsible for the actions of the plan so that they could be contacted and questioned, what was implemented that led to the success of the plan, when the important actions of the plan occurred, why certain actions were chosen, and how those actions were implemented. <p>Dissemination:</p> <p>The innovation zone plan contains a communication plan that collects information from and provides information for implementation and results of the plan to a wide range of those interested in the learning of students in addition to its representative constituents, the WVDE and the legislature. There is a plan to disseminate information about the implementation and success of the plan at state and national conferences and in peer reviewed journals.</p>

Score: _____ Comments: _____

11. Budget Justification: The budget justification should clearly be tied to the scope and requirements of the program. The budget narrative should describe the basis for determining the amounts shown on the program budget page.

Points: 0-5	Points: 6-10	Points: 11-15
<p>The budget provides:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> No justification or justification is vague for the program costs. 	<p>The budget provides:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Justification of costs of the program is reasonable and the budget meets program needs. 	<p>The budget provides:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Strong justification of costs of the program. Costs are reasonable and clearly show the budget is sufficient to meet program needs.

Score: _____ Comments: _____